

Delta College

HLC ID 1317

STANDARD PATHWAY: Mid-Cycle Review

Review Date: 4/22/2024

Dr. Michael Gavin
President

Linnea Stenson
HLC Liaison

Randy Hyman
Review Team Chair

Brad Baine
Team Member

Shannice Berry
Team Member

Craig Haile
Team Member

Wendy Marson
Team Member

Context and Nature of Review

Review Date

4/22/2024

Review Type:

Mid-Cycle Review

Scope of Review

- Mid-Cycle Review
- Federal Compliance (if applicable)
- On-site Visit

There are no forms assigned.

Institutional Context

Opening in 1961, Delta College is a comprehensive community college, providing post secondary educational opportunities to residents of Bay, Midland, and Saginaw counties in Michigan. Educational opportunities are available on Delta's main campus at University Center and at downtown centers in Bay City, Midland, and Saginaw. Students enroll and complete programs leading to an Associate degree as well as multiple certificate and pre-approved transfer programs. Delta supports the regional workforce by delivering non-credit training for local businesses of all sizes. Additionally, Delta serves several hundred high school students in dual enrollment programs through partnerships with local high schools. Delta's nine member Board of Trustees are elected, three members from each of the three counties in its service area.

Interactions with Constituencies

Associate Dean - Social Sciences Division

General Manager of Broadcast

Chief Information Officer (Ellucian)

Director of Workforce Strategies

Interim Director of Human Resources

Executive Director of Institutional Advancement

Controller

Vice President of Instruction and Learning Services

Director of Belonging, Diversity, Equity and Inclusion

Interim - Vice President of Business and Finance

Associate Dean - Health & Wellness Division

Associate Dean - Arts & Letters Division

President

Director of Marketing and Media Relations

Director of Facilities Management

Associate Dean - Science and Mathematics Division

David Dean of Transfer Programs and Online Learning

Karry Associate Dean of Student Retention

Interim - Director of Business Services

Dean of Enrollment and Access

Associate Dean of Enrollment Management

Vice President of Student Empowerment and Success

Associate Dean - Business & Technology Division

Chief Officer of Culture, Belonging, and Community Building

Administrative Assistant - President's Office

Dean of Occupational Programs and Workforce Strategies

Executive Director of Administrative Services and Institutional Effectiveness

Administrative Services Coordinator and Institutional Research Survey Specialist

Campus Life and Student Engagement Coordinator

Assistant Controller

Manager of Business and Auxiliary Services

Associate Director of Admissions and Dual Enrollment

Professor, Accounting

Professor, Psychology

Director of Educational Opportunity Center

Manager of the TLC and Testing Center

Manager of Library Programs and Services

Administrative Assistant to Vice President of Instruction and Learning Services

Admissions Technologist/Communications Coordinator

Associate Professor, Mathematics

Administrative Services Coordinator and Institutional Research Survey Specialist

Controller

Institutional Research Data Analyst and SES Research Specialist

Academic Data Analyst

11 students (attended the student open forum)

Four members of the current Board of Trustees

Professor, Mathematics

Lecturer, English

Instructor, English

Professor, Mechanical Tech and Design

Assistant Professor, Sociology

Professor, Psychology

Professor, Lifelong Wellness

Professor, Lifelong Wellness

Adjunct Instructor, Psychology

Instructor, Communication

Associate Professor, Mathematics

Professor, Political Science

Professor, English

Professor, Chemistry

Lisa Professor, Political Science

Associate Professor, Communication

Associate Professor, Lifelong Wellness

Assistant Professor, Sociology

Professor, Lifelong Wellness

Assistant Professor, Residential Construction

Associate Professor, Office Admin and Tech

Associate Professor, Welding

Associate Professor, Welding

Professor, English

Instructor, Nursing

Professor, Computer Science and Info Tech

Professor, Respiratory Care

Professor, English

Instructor, Communication

Adjunct Instructor, History

Instructor, Technical Trades and Manufacturing Division

Associate Professor, Mathematics

Associate Professor, Computer Science and Info Tech

Instructor, Biology

Second Chance Pell Coordinator / Student Success Advisor

Fourteen Student Success Advisors

Associate Director of Career Advising

Dual Enrollment and Early Middle College Navigator

Dual/Early Middle College Advising and Articulation Coordinator

Associate Director of Academic Advising

Team Lead, Business and Technology Advising

Team Lead, Health and Wellness Advising

11 support staff and 7 faculty attended the Open Forum for faculty and staff

Additional Documents

In addition to the Assurance Argument, documents in the Evidence file, documents placed into the Addendum by Delta College at the team's request, the team reviewed the "About Delta College" fact sheet and an extended strategic planning document "the way forward" both of which were provided to the team early in the visit.

1 - Mission

The institution's mission is clear and articulated publicly; it guides the institution's operations.

1.A - Core Component 1.A

The institution's mission is articulated publicly and operationalized throughout the institution.

1. The mission was developed through a process suited to the context of the institution.
2. The mission and related statements are current and reference the institution's emphasis on the various aspects of its mission, such as instruction, scholarship, research, application of research, creative works, clinical service, public service, economic development and religious or cultural purpose.
3. The mission and related statements identify the nature, scope and intended constituents of the higher education offerings and services the institution provides.
4. The institution's academic offerings, student support services and enrollment profile are consistent with its stated mission.
5. The institution clearly articulates its mission through public information, such as statements of purpose, vision, values, goals, plans or institutional priorities.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Recent events provide evidence that the mission of Delta College is current, aligned with its strategic plan and operationalized throughout the institution. The College has utilized a strategic plan since 2006. Led by a newly hired president the College began a review of its plan resulting in a major overhaul launched by the Board of Trustees in 2022. A Mission, Vision and Values (MVV) Summit in October of 2022 offered 180 Delta College employees an opportunity to provide input through facilitated focus groups. At the conclusion of the Summit, facilitators gathered and analyzed the data collected, summarizing all of the responses. Using the information an MVV cross-functional writing team, which included both faculty and staff, prepared written statements leading to a revised draft plan that was put to a campus wide vote. Finally, the Board of Trustees were presented with the draft statements and approved them as board policies.

Delta's approach for planning is outlined in the newly adopted strategic plan. It was evident from a meeting with Board members during the visit that the Board provides guidance and direction pertaining to the strategic focus of the institution. Discussions with faculty, staff, and students provided further evidence that the mission, vision, and values affirm Delta's commitment and ability to offer comprehensive array of educational opportunities to the regional community. Since 1961, Delta College has offered educational programs and services that respond to the needs of businesses and ensure that graduates are well-prepared to take their place within the work environment.

Delta College maintains a strong commitment to public service, economic development and culturally enriching community learning. The Delta mission guides work related to instruction, hands-on learning opportunities, and public service activities. It is evident that Delta focus on community needs aligns with its mission and goals. Delta College utilizes student learning outcomes, general education learning outcomes, program, and institutional learning outcomes to ensure the institution is successfully fulfilling its mission.

Delta's programs and services are available to all publics it serves and are offered in multiple modalities. Delta uses various media outlets and community events, as well as "Viewbook", flyers, and brochures to recruit students and promote academic offerings. In addition, the language on mailers, websites, and other printed materials is further customized to attract high school students and adult learners.

Delta College offers activities and events that are open to all students, but also to members of the community. Delta College's The President's Speaker Series features prominent nationally and internationally renowned speakers and is free and open to the public. The series provides powerful evidence of Delta's commitment to fulfill its mission regarding the public it serves. Through the series the College has hosted over 35 nationally recognized speakers.

In alignment with the mission and purpose of the institution, Delta provides academic instruction, career and technical training, and noncredit learning opportunities. Programs and services are offered across Delta's three county service area, utilizing industry partnerships, incubation activities, a technical center, regional high school facilities, and the Delta College Food Pantry. In recent academic years, the college has provided for the food needs of several thousand students.

University Center is the site of Delta's main campus and the College serves the surrounding communities with additional learning centers in Bay City, Midland, and Saginaw through on-ground and online learning environments. Delta partners with a variety of school districts in the service area to offer dual credit course work in facilities provided by the partnering school districts.

Delta College's mission and vision are stated publicly and posted prominently on campus. Delta ensures its employees are trained and familiar with the contents of the programs that are aligned with the mission of the college. Delta College's New Employee Orientation program introduces Delta's mission, vision, values, and culture. Additionally, the Faculty Center for Teaching Excellence (FCTE) supports both full-time and adjunct faculty with faculty-led professional development opportunities.

The institution is engaged in an ongoing dialog to realize the intent of its mission and vision. In meetings with faculty, staff, students, and administrators it was evident that a collective consensus exists around Delta's commitment to creating an innovative and caring learning and working environment that responds to the diverse backgrounds of student learning needs and emphasizes preparation for lifetime success.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

1.B - Core Component 1.B

The institution's mission demonstrates commitment to the public good.

1. The institution's actions and decisions demonstrate that its educational role is to serve the public, not solely the institution or any superordinate entity.
2. The institution's educational responsibilities take primacy over other purposes, such as generating financial returns for investors, contributing to a related or parent organization, or supporting external interests.
3. The institution engages with its external constituencies and responds to their needs as its mission and capacity allow.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Delta College embraces the concept of serving its students and the community through a foundation of fiscal strength and quality programs. The college offers programs that demonstrate a belief in public service and conservation of resources, which strengthens the institution's ability to offer continuing affordable education. It is clear that education is Delta's primary focus and the needs of its academic and student services divisions drive strategic planning. Evidence of Delta's commitment to serving the public good in the region is reflected by enrichment programs hosted or sponsored by the college for area K-12 students. Two examples include a Middle School Mathematics Competition and an annual Student Technical Solutions Competition on campus. Delta's 40 advisory committees offer further evidence of its commitment to building relationships with external stakeholders that benefit both the public and the institution.

The College offers general education and elective courses for students seeking Associate of Arts, Associate of Science, Associate of Applied Science, and Associate of General Studies degrees. Delta provides courses for students desiring to transfer to other institutions, certificates, certifications, and programs for career and technical education, customized training, developmental education, and GED courses to help students prepare for college. Delta also supports its communities through noncredit learning and life enrichment activities. Through partnerships with business and industry, other higher education institutions and through Delta's own educational and community outreach, the College and its programs support student and community needs.

In defining its scope and offerings, Delta seeks to differentiate its programs and services from competing institutions in the region. Central to this effort is collaboration with business and industry to ensure programs are meeting the needs of the region's workforce. This is accomplished through regular meetings with established advisory committees for career and technical education. The advisory committee meets regularly and provides insight and direction to the College regarding the workforce. It was evident from onsite conversations, Delta has achieved alignment with career credential certification offerings designed to give students the necessary skills to secure a high-wage

high-demand job in the region. Delta College staff have connected with local business and industry leaders to learn what specific knowledge, skills, and abilities they need their employees to possess. Delta maintains active partnerships with local or regional workforce and economic development agencies. Delta College offers career credential programs, while also earning academic credit at Delta College. The College provides customized on-site training for area companies, employees, or both. Delta serves the industries of manufacturing, business, agriculture, healthcare, education, energy, finance, and government.

Delta College has Downtown Centers in: Bay, Midland, and Saginaw Counties and these allow for active partnerships with local employers including hospitals and health care providers.

Apprenticeships in some of the learning centers are evidence of developing programs to meet the industry's needs within the skilled trades area of the College, allowing employers to support those they hire as they develop their skills while attending Delta College. The program is designed to partner with local businesses to provide top-notch, hands-on training in the state-of-the-art labs. Delta College works with nearly 40 companies and 130 students each year to offer apprenticeships.

In addition to community and industry training, the College serves the community through dual enrollment opportunities, collaborating with senior and middle-level leaders in school districts across the service area. Through this collaboration, students have access to college-level coursework, including the opportunity to participate in and attain certificates and associate degrees concurrent with completion of high school graduation requirements.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

1.C - Core Component 1.C

The institution provides opportunities for civic engagement in a diverse, multicultural society and globally connected world, as appropriate within its mission and for the constituencies it serves.

1. The institution encourages curricular or cocurricular activities that prepare students for informed citizenship and workplace success.
2. The institution's processes and activities demonstrate inclusive and equitable treatment of diverse populations.
3. The institution fosters a climate of respect among all students, faculty, staff and administrators from a range of diverse backgrounds, ideas and perspectives.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Delta College makes a strategic and concentrated effort to “establish the institution as an instrument of positive social change” by offering curricular and cocurricular activities, such as, Democracy Commitment, Citizens in Action Student Club, Delta Votes!, Democracy Summits, State Lobbying Day, Change Your World Week, Public Achievement, Political Forum Series, and Excellence in Civic Leadership Award. Along with these curricular and cocurricular civic activities, Delta has received state and national recognition for its civic engagement efforts. Delta provides support and educational opportunities in preparing graduates to make a difference in the way they live and work by emphasizing the importance of being mindful of the interconnectedness of people, profit, and the planet. As an example several Delta College courses have been designed with sustainability in mind, so students can learn and explore in depth the three aspects of sustainability – environmental, social, or economic.

Delta's active promotion, advocacy and, respect for differences was a common theme echoed in on-site discussions with the visiting team. Delta College has an environment of openness and appreciation for all. Faculty, staff, and students shared specific examples that confirm Delta's efforts to provide an inclusive and equitable environment. Delta embraces diversity as a core principle pertaining to course development, engagement, and human resources. This embrace includes and appreciation for perspectives and identities underrepresented in the mainstream of our society due to religion, national origin, age, sex, marital status, sexual orientation, gender identity, height, weight, arrest record, veteran status, or disability. Delta utilizes a number of events and activities to celebrate and educate the college and community on the importance of inclusive and equitable treatment.

Aspects of belonging, equity, diversity, and inclusion (BEDI) permeate throughout Delta College. Efforts of administrators, faculty, staff, and students have led to an institutional culture of respect for all individuals. In August of 2022, Delta hired an inaugural Chief Officer of Culture, Belonging, and Community Building (COCBCB). Under the leadership of the chief officer, the BEDI Services Division has developed a two-pronged approach: creating new BEDI positions and transferring positions from other divisions.

Delta requires an explicit commitment to BEDI in its hiring practices. All job postings and descriptions reflect a focus on diversity, equity, and inclusion. Furthermore, Delta reviews employee data to monitor employee retention rates, advancement opportunities, and accountability practices. Delta employee evaluations factor in innovation and equity. Onsite conversations confirmed that Delta is committed to building and providing an educational environment that is saturated with respect and appreciation for all students, faculty, staff, and administrators.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

1.S - Criterion 1 - Summary

The institution's mission is clear and articulated publicly; it guides the institution's operations.

Rationale

Delta College fulfills Criterion 1 through a clearly articulated mission and vision. The mission, vision, and institutional values are the foundation of the institution, serving to guide institutional purpose, planning, and identity. Through the strategic planning process, specific goals and priorities are determined which link directly to the mission, vision, and institutional values. These goals and priorities drive the work of faculty and staff in developing a culture of support and care for students both educationally and professionally.

Serving students throughout Bay, Midland, and Saginaw counties, as well as surrounding counties the College strives to provide learning opportunities and prepare students for the next step in their educational journey. With education as its core purpose, the College is committed to serving the public good in the region and to building relationships with external stakeholders that benefit both the public and the institution. Delta's effort to fulfill its mission and vision include collaboration with business and industry to ensure programs are meeting the needs of the workforce. Diversity is valued and addressed through the institutional brand and is integrated into the strategic plan. From recruitment to completion, Delta shapes the future for students, staff, and the community in a caring environment through dynamic instruction, programs, and support services.

2 - Integrity: Ethical and Responsible Conduct

The institution acts with integrity; its conduct is ethical and responsible.

2.A - Core Component 2.A

The institution establishes and follows policies and processes to ensure fair and ethical behavior on the part of its governing board, administration, faculty and staff.

1. The institution develops and the governing board adopts the mission.
2. The institution operates with integrity in its financial, academic, human resources and auxiliary functions.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Onsite meetings with faculty, staff, students, and board members reinforce narrative in the assurance argument that Delta College follows established policies and processes to ensure fair and ethical behavior on the parts of its governing board, administration, faculty, and staff. The Delta College community, including campus leadership, faculty, and staff embody the principle of integrity. The mission, vision, and values of Delta College, approved by the Board of Trustees in December 2022, support the college's commitment to students, faculty, and staff.

The onsite visit confirmed Delta College's commitment to its mission, vision, and values. In the Criterion 1 and 2 meeting, it was stated that the college's mission, vision, and values are “pushed to a level of permeation.” Staff in attendance echoed this in their observations about the college's multilayered process to arrive at the most recent iteration of the mission.

A combination of external and internal oversight ensures Delta College's integrity in its financial transactions. The college undergoes annual financial audits by an external agency. This is evidenced by Board Policy 4.001, noted in the assurance argument: “The audit process is periodically rebid, and if selected, an auditing firm can be appointed annually, but the same auditor cannot serve for more than five consecutive audits.” Auditors have classified the last ten annual audit reports as “unqualified,” concluding that the financial statements are fair and transparent. Meeting minutes from the November 2023 Board of Trustees meeting provide further evidence of the college's audit process and the board's approval of findings.

The College is dedicated to upholding academic standards and fostering a culture of integrity among its students, faculty, and staff. Several resources and policies reflect adherence to guiding principles including references to academic integrity in the Faculty Collective Bargaining Agreement, the Student Handbook, and Board Policy 2.007—Delta College Code of Ethical Conduct.

Delta prioritizes creating inclusive environments free from discrimination, sexual harassment, and inappropriate relationships. The annual Clery Report offers insights into the College's ongoing educational initiatives, prevention strategies, and the incidence of such issues on campus, further illustrating Delta's commitment to maintaining a safe and respectful community for all.

Delta College's commitment to fair and equitable hiring practices is exemplified through its Human Resources (HR) recruitment processes for faculty, staff, and student workers. These processes, including recruitment and search committee protocols and on-campus student employment procedures, support Delta's position on fair and equitable practices. To uphold objectivity, search committee members must undergo unconscious bias training, sign a confidentiality statement, and complete a search committee acknowledgment form. Additionally, a documentation screening matrix supports impartiality in applicant evaluation. During the visit, the staff described recruitment, hiring, and onboarding practices that include active participation of 40 trained Inclusion Advocates whose role is to ensure a diverse and inclusive applicant pool.

In 2023, the employment of student workers was centralized within Human resources to remove barriers and streamline the hiring process. During the visit, students confirmed that the opportunities for on-campus employment are accessible via the website and easy to navigate. Students discussed that the pay rate is different from that of jobs off campus, which their peers have noted as a reason to work outside of the College. However, students in the forum affirmed that those employed within the college appreciated their roles, the flexibility of being a student worker, and the support of their supervisors and the larger college community.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

2.B - Core Component 2.B

The institution presents itself clearly and completely to its students and to the public.

1. The institution ensures the accuracy of any representations it makes regarding academic offerings, requirements, faculty and staff, costs to students, governance structure and accreditation relationships.
2. The institution ensures evidence is available to support any claims it makes regarding its contributions to the educational experience through research, community engagement, experiential learning, religious or spiritual purpose and economic development.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Delta College communicates accurately with its students, faculty, staff, and community members. The College website serves as a source of information, covering essential topics such as the college catalog, tuition and fees, governance structure, and accreditation relationships. The College utilizes various channels to disseminate information, ensuring accessibility and transparency.

The Marketing Department oversees the maintenance and organization of Delta's online platforms, including the public website and two internal sites catering to specific audiences. These platforms provide easily accessible and reliable information to visitors, meeting high standards of presentation and accuracy.

Delta has taken steps to ensure transparency, including distributing documents such as the mission, vision, values, institutional policies, governance details, and accreditation information. The College regularly updates any changes in academic offerings, policies, and other relevant details, preventing confusion and ensuring stakeholders can access the most current information on the college website. Staff members confirmed during the visit that 30-40 people within Delta College have access to edit content on the college website, which is then subjected to approval by a designee of the Executive Director of Institutional Advancement.

Delta College maintains several social media pages operated by departments within the College. The College adheres to a Social Media guide which outlines the appropriate use of these subsidiary outlets. The visiting team confirmed that the operating parameters outlined in the guide are implemented by the College to safeguard information sharing with the public.

Delta College's interactive College Catalog details programs, courses, degree requirements, tuition, fees, accreditation agreements, academic policies, and includes the student handbook. The Student Right-to-Know site provides federally mandated public disclosure of completion and transfer rates, aiding informed decision-making. Upon review of the Student Right to Know webpage, it was noted that the most recent data points regarding retention and program pass rates were from the fall of 2019-2020. The College should update these data to ensure that the most current rates are available

to students and other audiences.

In addition to informational resources, Delta College emphasizes its mission to empower a diverse and inclusive community to achieve personal, professional, and academic goals. The Student Engagement Office facilitates out-of-classroom experiences and events, offering over 40 special-interest clubs and organizations, volunteer opportunities, and leadership development programs. The visiting team confirmed that student engagement opportunities were available. In the Criterion 1 and 2 meeting, the team learned about a Spring Break 2024 Alternative Break trip to Bloomington, South Carolina, hosted by the Campus Life and Student Engagement Coordinator. Student participants fundraised and planned the agenda of activities for the event. Additionally, the team observed a student-planned and implemented Mental Health and Wellness Fair during the visit, which included external community partners.

Approximately 115 student-athletes participate in sports such as Men's Basketball, Baseball, and Golf, as well as Women's Basketball, Volleyball, Softball, and Soccer. During the Student Open Forum, the visiting team met several student-athletes who provided insight into the academic and student services to which they have access including early registration and a designated new student-athlete orientation hosted by the Athletics department.

The Student Leadership Academy plays a significant role in campus and regional engagement, organizing events such as the Diversity Symposium and Celebration of Athletics. Student-athletes participate in various sports, while students interested in journalism can contribute to the Delta Collegiate newspaper. The College also offers theater productions and the President's Speaker Series, which features diverse speakers and cultural perspectives. Study Abroad opportunities are available for students as noted on the website and through onsite conversations. Staff members confirmed that Study Abroad opportunities had been paused since 2020, due to COVID restrictions but will be offered again in the 2024-2025 academic year.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

2.C - Core Component 2.C

The governing board of the institution is autonomous to make decisions in the best interest of the institution in compliance with board policies and to ensure the institution's integrity.

1. The governing board is trained and knowledgeable so that it makes informed decisions with respect to the institution's financial and academic policies and practices; the board meets its legal and fiduciary responsibilities.
2. The governing board's deliberations reflect priorities to preserve and enhance the institution.
3. The governing board reviews the reasonable and relevant interests of the institution's internal and external constituencies during its decision-making deliberations.
4. The governing board preserves its independence from undue influence on the part of donors, elected officials, ownership interests or other external parties.
5. The governing board delegates day-to-day management of the institution to the institution's administration and expects the institution's faculty to oversee academic matters.

Rating

Met

Rationale

The Delta College Board of Trustees operates independently and is committed to advancing the institution's best interests through various established mechanisms. The Board's governance structure, including the presentation of documents, trustee training, composition, and consistent application of policies, reflects its dedication to Delta College's sustainability and success. The board's role and responsibilities are outlined in the organizational chart and Board Bylaws, emphasizing fiduciary affairs and financial sustainability. During the visit, Board members confirmed their understanding of their role and provided examples of operating within their designated capacities. In discussion with the team, they reiterated the importance of having an "equal voice" among the members.

Board members who met with the visiting team, emphasized that their work is deeply rooted in the college's mission, vision, and values. They reiterated their commitment to the strategic plan, ensuring its alignment with the college's core principles. This commitment, driven by data and DEI, serves as a strong foundation for the college's progress. A Board member further underscored the importance of data by sharing, "What gets measured, gets done."

The Board makes informed decisions about financial and academic policies and practices consistent with its legal and fiduciary responsibilities, as outlined in the Delta College Bylaws. Newly elected trustees undergo orientation sessions conducted by college leadership and external organizations like the Michigan Community College Association and the Association of Community College Trustees. During the visit, the team heard comments from board members that confirmed board expectations regarding their orientation, training, and professional development.

The Board approves institutional budgets, expenditures, and audits and, through its committees,

provides oversight of college leadership and relevant areas. The Board Vice Chair is a member of the Budget Cabinet, which is charged with researching and recommending tuition changes to the college President.

Board's deliberations are guided by a commitment to Delta's preservation and enhancement. This is evident in their dedication to funding capital expenditures and maintaining a healthy fund balance. The composition of the Board, with trustees elected from the three primary counties served by the College, ensures diverse representation and community engagement. The Board discussed their role in responding to the needs of their constituents, highlighting initiatives such as the hiring of a Chief Culture Officer and the creation of the BEDI unit to address the needs of underrepresented populations. They also mentioned their collaboration with local public schools and the creation of the Saginaw Success Academy as direct responses to community needs.

The Board maintains independence from undue influence and ethical conduct among its members, as outlined in its Bylaws and operating parameters, including conflict of interest disclosures and adherence to ethical standards. Day-to-day management of the College is delegated to college administration, with faculty overseeing academic program development and evaluation. The Board entrusts the President with authority over personnel, financial matters, investments, and compliance with legal requirements.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

2.D - Core Component 2.D

The institution is committed to academic freedom and freedom of expression in the pursuit of truth in teaching and learning.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Delta College maintains a commitment to principles of academic freedom and freedom of expression, recognizing their crucial role in fostering an environment conducive to the pursuit of truth in teaching and learning. Central to Delta's mission is cultivating a campus community that encourages the exchange of diverse viewpoints, fostering a sense of belonging and intellectual stimulation among students and faculty alike.

Delta collaborated with stakeholders to define and implement principles of belonging, equity, diversity, and inclusion (BEDI) to promote personal and professional growth, ensuring a shared understanding across the college community. In recent years, Delta established a dedicated BEDI Division that offers specialized courses focused on BEDI issues. Inclusive practices are embedded throughout hiring processes, supported by training sessions for new employees and the involvement of inclusion advocates in the hiring process. Human Resources staff members confirmed the implementation of these practices during the visit. (See Criterion 1..)

Delta safeguards the rights of its students, faculty, and staff to engage in expressive activities. Provisions outlined in the Faculty Collective Bargaining Agreement (CBA) support academic freedom. Students and faculty are granted freedom of expression both on and off campus, and mechanisms are in place to address violations.

Faculty and staff are afforded opportunities for professional development and creative pursuits through sabbatical leave, with processes outlined in the CBA and relevant handbooks. Sabbatical projects encompass a wide range of activities, from research endeavors to participation in leadership projects, with recipients required to provide reports and presentations upon completion.

Upholding academic freedom and freedom of expression, Delta College is committed to fostering a culture that values and protects these principles, ensuring they remain integral to its core values.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

2.E - Core Component 2.E

The institution's policies and procedures call for responsible acquisition, discovery and application of knowledge by its faculty, staff and students.

1. Institutions supporting basic and applied research maintain professional standards and provide oversight ensuring regulatory compliance, ethical behavior and fiscal accountability.
2. The institution provides effective support services to ensure the integrity of research and scholarly practice conducted by its faculty, staff and students.
3. The institution provides students guidance in the ethics of research and use of information resources.
4. The institution enforces policies on academic honesty and integrity.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Delta College's commitment to responsible acquisition, discovery, and application of knowledge among its students, faculty, and staff is reflected through the implementation of stringent policies and procedures and oversight provided by the Institutional Review Board (IRB). In line with its teaching and learning principles, Delta's faculty are encouraged, though not obligated, to present examples of their research during promotion and tenure procedures. Research involving human subjects on campus must receive IRB approval; this is evidenced through a process involving the completion of an application for research study form and adherence to a research review committee checklist. The IRB ensures compliance with professional, regulatory, and ethical standards, with approved candidates obtaining access to research data through a careful review process conducted by the Office of Institutional Research. Although, during the visit, the team could not confirm the implementation of these practices within the college, in the Criterion 1 and 2 meeting, staff present observed that the College had few IRB requests. However, they acknowledged a committee of approximately four faculty members who managed these requests.

Students engaging in human subjects research as part of their coursework must complete the IRB process. Delta College offers support services to students, including library research assistance, research guides, and writing consultation services through the Writing, Reading and Information Technology (WRIT) Center, facilitating effective communication skills development.

Delta College emphasizes the importance of ethical conduct for students. This is evidenced by the student code of ethical policy, which highlights academic integrity, avoiding misconduct, and adherence to high standards of honesty and truthfulness in academic work. The Student Handbook further reinforces these values, defining plagiarism and outlining students' responsibilities in upholding academic principles and their association with academic violations. It also highlights the role of students and faculty in the process.

Faculty can access TurnItIn plagiarism detection software and have an outlined reporting process for

alleged violations. The process for addressing violations involves notifying the student, meeting with them, and determining appropriate consequences in accordance with college policies. Additionally, students may be subject to the student conduct process, with sanctions imposed based on the severity of the violation, ensuring accountability and upholding the integrity of academic standards at Delta College.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

2.S - Criterion 2 - Summary

The institution acts with integrity; its conduct is ethical and responsible.

Rationale

Delta College is committed to ethical conduct and transparency among its various stakeholder groups including faculty, staff, students, and board members. The College upholds established policies to ensure fairness and integrity. Communication efforts, from the website to various other channels, facilitate accessibility and openness in disseminating crucial information to the community. The Board of Trustees operates autonomously, driven by a collective dedication to advancing the institution's interests, as evidenced by structured governance mechanisms and adherence to fiduciary responsibilities. Moreover, Delta College fosters an environment of academic freedom and diverse perspectives. The college's emphasis on transparency, ethical conduct, and fostering an environment conducive to intellectual exchange underscores its dedication to its mission and values.

3 - Teaching and Learning: Quality, Resources and Support

The institution provides quality education, wherever and however its offerings are delivered.

3.A - Core Component 3.A

The rigor of the institution's academic offerings is appropriate to higher education.

1. Courses and programs are current and require levels of student performance appropriate to the credential awarded.
2. The institution articulates and differentiates learning goals for its undergraduate, graduate, post-baccalaureate, post-graduate and certificate programs.
3. The institution's program quality and learning goals are consistent across all modes of delivery and all locations (on the main campus, at additional locations, by distance delivery, as dual credit, through contractual or consortial arrangements, or any other modality).

Rating

Met

Rationale

Delta College programs are current, of appropriate rigor, and meet standards of quality for the range of certificates and associate degrees offered.

Delta awards pre- and post-associate certificates, associate degrees, and other credentials for licensure or certification requirements. Programs are subject to a standard definition of the credit hour expressed in college documents and minimum requirements required for degrees and certificates are typical for the level awarded. Certificates of Completion or Achievement are for short-term programs leading to entry-level employment and basic skills, or to prepare for an advanced certificate or degree. Advanced Certificates are typically 24 credits or more, and may prepare for an industry certification or be stackable into an associate degree, which requires a minimum of 62 credit hours. A minimum GPA of 2.0 is required for both certificates and degrees.

Delta College has a variety of systems and processes which provide evidence that courses and programs are both current and appropriate. The Curriculum Council oversees development and revision of courses and programs based upon advice and recommendations of the Curriculum Proposal Review Team. Both bodies have representation from faculty, staff, and administration, with faculty having the largest membership of the Council. Program review and assessment is conducted by faculty but guided by the Student Learning Assessment Committee (SLAC) and also various Program advisory committees. Advisory committees have broad representation from college faculty, staff, and occupational leaders, who provide input on program design and learning outcomes. During the onsite visit college faculty mentioned they are experimenting moving to a business and industry leadership team (BILT) model which asks industry experts to take on a larger leadership role and validate the job skills students will learn. The advisory committees meet one to three times annually, while comprehensive program reviews occur on a five-year cycle. Program reviews evaluate data on course success,

graduation and transfer rates, as well as pass rates on licensure exams, results of outcomes assessment, and feedback from external accreditors.

Aside from internal processes, agreements with the state also make evident the currency and transferability of courses in regards to general education. Delta's transfer degrees are aligned with the Michigan Transfer Agreement (MTA), which provides for the transfer of a 30-hour block of general education requirements at participating Michigan college and universities. Curriculum mapping is used at both the program and general education level to confirm that students are required to master the knowledge and skills expected of graduates.

Learning outcomes are established at the course, program (including transfer/general education), and institutional level. Program level outcomes are aligned with the four Institutional Learning Outcomes (ISLOs), which have been in place since 2014. Course level outcomes were consistently found in the syllabus template and example syllabi, and as part of the course descriptions on the college website. In some examples of syllabi and in some program descriptions on the website, program level outcomes were found. However, while there is a page on the college website with links to degree and certificate programs, very few of these were found to list program level outcomes. Delta should consider more consistently articulating program level outcomes on the college website for all associate degree and stand-alone certificate programs.

Delta points to policies on dual enrollment and distance learning training as evidence that academic departments and faculty maintain consistent quality and learning goals across modes of delivery and locations. Delta does not offer concurrent dual enrollment for high school students taught by high school teachers, but does offer courses to a small number of high school students on their campus with college faculty members teaching college courses. The bulk of high school students taking courses do so on the Delta campus as dual enrollment or Early Middle College students. These students and the faculty teaching the courses have the same expectations and access to resources as other student and faculty types. Delta has an eLearning committee and eLearning Office that provide training opportunities and oversight, in conjunction with discipline and program coordinators, to ensure online delivery of courses is done consistently with other methods of delivery and with best practices.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

3.B - Core Component 3.B

The institution offers programs that engage students in collecting, analyzing and communicating information; in mastering modes of intellectual inquiry or creative work; and in developing skills adaptable to changing environments.

1. The general education program is appropriate to the mission, educational offerings and degree levels of the institution. The institution articulates the purposes, content and intended learning outcomes of its undergraduate general education requirements.
2. The program of general education is grounded in a philosophy or framework developed by the institution or adopted from an established framework. It imparts broad knowledge and intellectual concepts to students and develops skills and attitudes that the institution believes every college-educated person should possess.
3. The education offered by the institution recognizes the human and cultural diversity and provides students with growth opportunities and lifelong skills to live and work in a multicultural world.
4. The faculty and students contribute to scholarship, creative work and the discovery of knowledge to the extent appropriate to their offerings and the institution's mission.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Delta's general education program is appropriate to the College's mission, educational offerings, and degree levels. The general education program is integrated throughout associate degree programs, and is designed to align with the requirements of the Michigan Transfer Agreement (MTA), thus ensuring the appropriateness and transferability of core courses. The 30 credit hours in the MTA form a traditional core of English, Humanities, Mathematics, Natural and Social Sciences.

The MTA determines distribution requirements but Delta determines its general education learning outcomes (GELOs). Six GELOs were approved by faculty in 2016: Think Civically, Cultivate Wellness, Utilize Technology Efficiently, Reason Quantitatively, Communicate Effectively, Think Critically. Each GELO has an attached goal which provides context and detail to what it means to demonstrate attainment of the outcome. The GELOs have clear alignment with core courses and the Institutional Learning Outcomes (ISLOs, approved 2014), which are to Apply skills and knowledge, Communicate effectively, Think critically, and Act Responsibly. These outcomes are articulated clearly on the college website and in the college catalog. Rubrics establishing proficiency have been derived from a Lumina Foundation model with input from groups of Delta faculty. Assessment of GELOs takes place on a three-year cycle, hence two GELOs are assessed each year. Delta has finished two complete cycles of assessment.

Delta ensures that the education offered by the Institution addresses diversity through its policies and programs. Board policy states a respect and value for human and cultural diversity and the goal of

providing a welcoming environment of openness and appreciation for all. Delta engages students with these values through curriculum and other activities. The GELO “think civically” includes the goal language that students will “demonstrate an understanding of diverse societies, ranging from local to global, in order to engage effectively in civic life.” This GELO is present and measured in every program. Also, Delta requires all AA and AS graduates to complete a 15-hour civic engagement project, which can include service learning. During the onsite visit Delta faculty mentioned projects from Political Science, History, and Journalism courses, as well as individual projects that could fulfill the requirement. Other programs mentioned which provide evidence that Delta offers growth opportunities for students include the President’s Speaker Series, various clubs overseen by the Student and Civic Engagement Office, the "Democracy Commitment" designed to engage students in civic learning, and the "Leadership Pyramid."

Delta encourages scholarship, creative work, and discovery of knowledge in a manner appropriate for its mission. Faculty applications for sabbatical leave are evaluated on the basis that the leave be “reciprocally advantageous to the applicant and the College.” In onsite meetings with faculty and administration it was asserted that "one to two faculty per year" were typically granted sabbaticals. The visit team heard observations that Delta students have won awards for scholarly contributions and activities directed by faculty.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

3.C - Core Component 3.C

The institution has the faculty and staff needed for effective, high-quality programs and student services.

1. The institution strives to ensure that the overall composition of its faculty and staff reflects human diversity as appropriate within its mission and for the constituencies it serves.
2. The institution has sufficient numbers and continuity of faculty members to carry out both the classroom and the non-classroom roles of faculty, including oversight of the curriculum and expectations for student performance, assessment of student learning, and establishment of academic credentials for instructional staff.
3. All instructors are appropriately qualified, including those in dual credit, contractual and consortial offerings.
4. Instructors are evaluated regularly in accordance with established institutional policies and procedures.
5. The institution has processes and resources for assuring that instructors are current in their disciplines and adept in their teaching roles; it supports their professional development.
6. Instructors are accessible for student inquiry.
7. Staff members providing student support services, such as tutoring, financial aid advising, academic advising and cocurricular activities, are appropriately qualified, trained and supported in their professional development.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Delta College has established processes and dedicated resources to ensure that it can recruit, develop, and retain a qualified and effective cadre of faculty and staff.

Delta College is committed to improving the diversity of the institution that reflects the population of the region but acknowledged recruiting a workforce reflective of regional demographics remains challenging. It observed that "recent initiatives have enhanced the diversity of our applicant pools", and provided a list of 10 strategies related to the initiatives.

Delta has sufficient numbers of faculty needed to carry out their responsibilities. The Institution has a faculty to student ratio of 16:1, in line with the state community college average. According to the Collective Bargaining Agreement (CBA), base load is 30 "equated" hours in the fall and winter semester, a standard number for community colleges. The CBA also states that the college strives to maintain, as a minimum, at least 55% of total equated hours taught by full-time faculty. In onsite meetings it was observed that this minimum is achieved and often exceeded. Delta uses discipline and program coordinators to help ensure efficient oversight of academic departments and programs and effective coordination with administration. These coordinators are given release time to fulfill their tasks as determined by the CBA.

Through a review of the CBA and the faculty qualifications database, it was confirmed both full-time and adjunct faculty are hired using credentialing standards consistent with HLC policy. As outlined in the CBA, a screening committee of faculty and staff, chaired by a faculty member of the discipline when possible, determines qualified applicants and conducts interviews. Final hiring authority rests with the president.

Delta evaluates faculty regularly in accordance with its policies. The CBA outlines the evaluation process for full-time faculty. Annual evaluations are conducted for non-tenured faculty and those on a performance improvement plan. Tenured faculty also complete relevant sections of the evaluation form each year as well and submit to their Associate Dean (AD). The sections of the evaluation form are A) Demonstrated Teaching Effectiveness, B) Demonstrated Professional Development, C) Demonstrated Leadership (if applicable), D) Demonstrated Service to Delta College, and E) Demonstrated Collegiality and Collaboration. Adjunct faculty are evaluated using student feedback, classroom observation, and examination of documents. In onsite meetings the visiting team learned that adjunct faculty are evaluated at least once in a three-year cycle. Faculty evaluation is consistent for faculty who teach in-person or online.

Evidence that Delta College supports professional development of both faculty and staff is reflected in three dimensions. . Each faculty member has a professional development plan, and receives an annual professional development allowance of \$1100, which may be used for travel, dues, coursework, fees, materials, and other appropriate expenses. Delta has a generous policy of allowing up to 100% carried forward to the next budget year, with a cumulative amount not to exceed three times the current year allocation. Administrative staff are eligible for an annual allowance of \$500. Support staff may receive up to \$275 to support their professional development. Adjunct faculty are offered professional development through the Faculty Center for Teaching Excellence (FCTE). The FCTE offers grants that may be used to attend conferences, workshops, or for coursework. New adjuncts receive stipends for participating in professional development such as “Adjunct Academy” and mandatory eLearning modules.

Full-time faculty are required to hold at least five student office hours per week, in-person or virtually in proportion to the ratio of online to in-person teaching. Office hours may be reduced if under the base load. Office hours are posted in an approved location, put in syllabi, and placed in an electronic calendar. During the onsite visit students indicated that faculty were generally accessible, but some mentioned a lack of timely feedback and communication from faculty teaching online courses.

Delta has a well-defined process of defining the jobs skills and knowledge base needed for staff positions providing student services. Both full-time and part-time staff have requirements for annual internal training and professional development. As previously noted, full-time staff have an annual professional development allowance from \$275-\$500 depending on their function, which can be supplemented by administrative operational funds. Professional development plans are approved by supervisors and are part of the periodic evaluation process.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

3.D - Core Component 3.D

The institution provides support for student learning and resources for effective teaching.

1. The institution provides student support services suited to the needs of its student populations.
2. The institution provides for learning support and preparatory instruction to address the academic needs of its students. It has a process for directing entering students to courses and programs for which the students are adequately prepared.
3. The institution provides academic advising suited to its offerings and the needs of its students.
4. The institution provides to students and instructors the infrastructure and resources necessary to support effective teaching and learning (technological infrastructure, scientific laboratories, libraries, performance spaces, clinical practice sites and museum collections, as appropriate to the institution's offerings).

Rating

Met

Rationale

Delta provides support for student learning and resources for effective teaching, including in-person and online modalities, and for traditional age, high school, and adult learners. Comprehensive student support services available to all students at Delta include orientation for first-time students, an early alert system, career services, advising, guided self-placement, tele mental health, library services including computers and research databases, laptop computer checkout, and both virtual and in-person tutoring. Services are offered for specific student groups such as early middle college students, high school students from school systems with higher-than-average poverty rates, and those with disabilities. Support programs at Delta appear to be well suited to the diverse needs of the student population.

Delta has placement processes and preparatory instruction to address the academic needs of its students and directs students to courses for which they are adequately prepared. In accordance with state recommendations, Delta uses a Guided Self-Placement (GSP) process for English and math placement. The GSP surveys utilize multiple measures such as student status, pathway, high school GPA, last discipline course, standardized test scores, and self-confidence to recommend courses, which could include developmental or co-requisite support courses. The GPS also directs students to meet with advisors and discuss the recommendations. The student survey question "I was placed at the appropriate course level that matched my academic preparation" was answered at an average 4.09 on a five-point Likert scale. Multiple conversations with faculty, staff, and students indicated that the GSP, when used in conjunction with advice from advisors, was effective in placing students correctly in developmental and extended hours gateway courses when necessary.

Delta offers comprehensive academic advising services for all types of students, including dual enrolled and middle college students, and even non-degree or non-certificate seeking students, at all locations and in all modalities. Advisors utilize a variety of communication methods so that they are easily accessible to students, and leverage technology through the early alert system and a "Delta

Advisor Dashboard”. Advising is mandatory for some student categories, such as First-Time-In-Any-College (FTIAC), and students in certain academic or financial aid categories. In 2022 Delta reorganized advisors by academic division, replacing a previous model based on student county of residence. Onsite discussion with advisors indicated they are embracing the new advising model, support and work well together as a team, and are engaged with faculty, program advisory boards, and other support staff in helping students move toward completion. Academic advisors complete 12 hours of annual required professional development and also have other internal and external opportunities. Questions related to advising on the student survey generally averaged near or over four on a five-point Likert scale, although student knowledge of transfer and program requirements was identified as an area of challenge on the Noel-Levitz survey.

Delta provides to students and instructors the infrastructure and resources necessary to support effective teaching and learning. Funds in the general budget and transfers to the plant fund provide present and future support for educational resources and technology needs. Lifecycle reviews are established for all types of technology infrastructure. Delta has adequate learning and academic support spaces at the main campus and additional locations, including upgrades to the D2L Learning Management System (LMS), smart boards allowing virtual meetings in all classrooms, and enhanced audio and video functionality in many clinical classroom and lab spaces. Some noted facility improvements that provide evidence of support for effective teaching and learning include a \$2.8 million renovation of public media and academic labs, and a \$5.7 million computer science wing renovation. Library resources and lab facilities were listed as strengths in the Noel-Levitz survey from December 2023. As noted in Criterion 5, Delta provides for continued proactive maintenance of infrastructure through an annual \$2.5 million transfer from general fund resources to the plant fund, as well as an allocation of any portion of excess savings.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

3.S - Criterion 3 - Summary

The institution provides quality education, wherever and however its offerings are delivered.

Rationale

Delta College has both internal processes and external agreements that help ensure the currency of academic programs. Learning outcomes are clearly established at the course, program, general education, and institutional level for certificate and associate degrees. Delta could more transparently articulate program level outcomes in public facing college materials, as it has done for course level, general education, and institutional outcomes.

The institution has a traditional general education core that is aligned with state transfer requirements. A 15-hour civic engagement project, required of all Associate degree graduates, is indicative of Institution values and mission.

Faculty and staff at Delta are qualified, provide a quality education and support to students, and have access to a well-maintained infrastructure and an impressive amount of professional development opportunities. The institution has made significant changes to course placement, developmental education, career services, and advising over the past few years. While it seems there has been some pain in the transition, they seem to have made much progress and have established a culture of support for student success.

4 - Teaching and Learning: Evaluation and Improvement

The institution demonstrates responsibility for the quality of its educational programs, learning environments and support services, and it evaluates their effectiveness for student learning through processes designed to promote continuous improvement.

4.A - Core Component 4.A

The institution ensures the quality of its educational offerings.

1. The institution maintains a practice of regular program reviews and acts upon the findings.
2. The institution evaluates all the credit that it transcripts, including what it awards for experiential learning or other forms of prior learning, or relies on the evaluation of responsible third parties.
3. The institution has policies that ensure the quality of the credit it accepts in transfer.
4. The institution maintains and exercises authority over the prerequisites for courses, rigor of courses, expectations for student learning, access to learning resources, and faculty qualifications for all its programs, including dual credit programs. It ensures that its dual credit courses or programs for high school students are equivalent in learning outcomes and levels of achievement to its higher education curriculum.
5. The institution maintains specialized accreditation for its programs as appropriate to its educational purposes.
6. The institution evaluates the success of its graduates. The institution ensures that the credentials it represents as preparation for advanced study or employment accomplish these purposes. For all programs, the institution looks to indicators it deems appropriate to its mission.

Rating

Met

Rationale

The 2020 review team found 4.A. to be, “met with concern” resulting from a perceived lack of a systematic and consistently regular practice of program reviews for academic degree programs. The team recommended an interim monitoring report on the processes set up to do program review in both career/tech education and academic transfer programs, including documentation of completed Program Review including timelines, faculty participation, data definitions, and documentation of CQI, to be submitted in fall 2023. The report was submitted by the College and found to be complete.

The visiting team engaged faculty and administration in conversations during the onsite visit to determine if the narrative in the Assurance Argument and the interim report is being operationalized at the College to the extent that it is becoming an institutionalized process.

In the meeting for Criterion 3 and 4, participants included faculty, Directors, Associate Deans, Deans, the Registrar, Institutional Research (IR), managers, and the VP for Student Empowerment and Success. When asked about Program Review, those present were positive about the process. One faculty member in attendance had helped write the interim report which also formed the foundation for the Assurance Argument. Faculty who were present in the meeting around dual-enrollment and the open forum for faculty and staff did not demonstrate deep understanding of the process for Program Review. However, many were discipline faculty versus program faculty, and with the five-year cycle in place, those faculty who were from programs had still not necessarily engaged with the process to any extent. Student Success staff mentioned that a similar review process for non-Academic units was being discussed.

During onsite meetings with the visiting team, several administrators discussed plans for continuing to grow Credit for Prior Learning (CPL) by aligning credit given for work experience with CE/CT. The Michigan Reconnect Initiative encourages adult learners with no previous college experience to return to school by offering tuition-free college. This initiative is expected to create the educated workforce Michigan desires for future economic growth.

As a result of this legislation, the College eliminated most developmental stand-alone courses, creating co-requisite courses that students could enter directly. The College also instituted a Guided Self-Placement (GSP) process to allow non-traditional students to better determine their pathway. In addition to shortening the sequence, the creation of these new processes also resulted in the elimination of many pre-requisite courses. There was a drop in overall success rates following the changes. The College had, during the pandemic, created a process called “COVID Catch-up” where students could attend stand-alone developmental courses free of charge if students needed additional coursework. This has continued, with the help of grant funding, as “Academic Catch-up”.

The visiting team met with dual-enrollment faculty and also asked administrative staff about processes for ensuring equivalencies in dual enrollment. Faculty are equally qualified regardless of where they provide instruction. Delta serves around 1700 dually enrolled students each academic year, with students largely attending courses on the Delta Campus. There are 50-some students who are instructed at the high schools by Delta faculty in a process called Direct Dual Enrollment. The College also provides instruction at the Saginaw Academy of Excellence, with attendance primarily comprised of Latino and Black/African American students. Dual enrolled students have a dedicated liaison to assist with registration, and they can access college services on request.

The pandemic resulted in changes to tutoring. In the conversation with students, there was a student who expressed concerns with the new system, which requires appointments to be made ahead of time using an electronic form. Previously, there were study tables in the library that were used for group studying and tutoring assistance, which also provided opportunities for informal peer tutoring of students in lower courses by more advanced students who were in attendance. The College provides online tutoring sessions to students who are not physically present during regular hours at the Teaching and Learning Center. No tutoring software (TutorTrac, etc.) is provided to online students.

The 2020 team had suggested that the college standardize its processes around specialized accreditation and articulate how programs with specialized accreditation are selected to do so. The visiting team asked those who attended the meeting for Criteria 3 and 4, and there does not appear to be a process. The explanation provided was that, if students need licensure in their field, the program will be accredited. A list of specialized accreditations was provided, and all are in good standing. There is no centralized process for managing specialized accreditations across the college, but rather program directors/division heads oversee the process with faculty, with data support from

Institutional Research.

The College is guided by its mission and Strategic Plan with a focus on completion of an award. Students are encouraged to finish a degree at Delta before moving on to employment or to a four-year University to continue their education. There is a Key Performance Indicator (KPI) in the strategic plan that addresses completion, tracked by IR with a goal of increasing their IPEDS cohort completion rate by an average of 3.8% annually.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

4.B - Core Component 4.B

The institution engages in ongoing assessment of student learning as part of its commitment to the educational outcomes of its students.

1. The institution has effective processes for assessment of student learning and for achievement of learning goals in academic and cocurricular offerings.
2. The institution uses the information gained from assessment to improve student learning.
3. The institution's processes and methodologies to assess student learning reflect good practice, including the substantial participation of faculty, instructional and other relevant staff members.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Core Component 4.B was met with concern by the 2020 team who recommended an interim monitoring report. Previous HLC teams were concerned that Delta College had not demonstrated consistent progress with implementing a rigorous, consistent, and sustained PLO assessment process. The College submitted a The monitoring report submitted to the HLC by the College was recently approved.

The Assurance Argument provided an extensive narrative around the transformation of assessment at the College, noting also that Delta had indeed been doing assessment since 2010 but had not done a good job of describing their processes at the time of the 2020 review. Although, there have been Institutional Student Learning Outcomes (ISLOs) in place since 2014, these were not being assessed. This was reiterated to the visiting team during the Criteria 3 and 4 onsite meeting by a faculty member who was in the meeting and had worked on the interim monitoring report. However, during the meeting, it was mentioned by faculty that Delta has consistent learning outcomes across all modalities and sites.

At the open forum for faculty and staff it was observed that the College included its course-level learning outcomes (CLLOs) for each course on its website, providing students with information about what they can expect to learn in each course. However, the process of including CLLOs in course descriptions has not been fully completed.

In onsite meetings the team held for Criteria 3 and 4, with dual-enrollment faculty, and in the Open Forum for faculty and staff, the visiting team asked how the process for course-level assessment was proceeding. The team, noting the absence of a consistent response across these three meetings, concluded that the process was not well understood or institutionalized.

Reference was made in the Assurance argument to a meeting in May 2023 to review assessments and discuss ISLO assessment results. The statement that, "many in attendance were not aware that so many assessments were taking place around the College and were pleasantly surprised", suggests that

work remains to be done on institutionalizing the processes and results of assessments, and more importantly, how those results are then being used to improve student learning. The college, through its Student Learning Action Committee (SLAC) may want to consider developing a communication strategy around the many-faceted processes related to assessment of student learning.

Delta's current practice regarding good assessment methodology, collecting data, documenting analysis of achieving targets and acting on results remains incomplete. Delta should increase the campus community's understanding of Program Learning Outcomes (PLO) assessment. Going forward, Delta should demonstrate how documented assessment data are being actively utilized to inform appropriate pedagogical changes, curriculum modifications, and program changes to improve student learning. In addition to process changes, semester monitoring of assessment results of the ISLO, PLO, and GELO could benefit the college.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

4.C - Core Component 4.C

The institution pursues educational improvement through goals and strategies that improve retention, persistence and completion rates in its degree and certificate programs.

1. The institution has defined goals for student retention, persistence and completion that are ambitious, attainable and appropriate to its mission, student populations and educational offerings.
2. The institution collects and analyzes information on student retention, persistence and completion of its programs.
3. The institution uses information on student retention, persistence and completion of programs to make improvements as warranted by the data.
4. The institution's processes and methodologies for collecting and analyzing information on student retention, persistence and completion of programs reflect good practice. (Institutions are not required to use IPEDS definitions in their determination of persistence or completion rates. Institutions are encouraged to choose measures that are suitable to their student populations, but institutions are accountable for the validity of their measures.)

Rating

Met

Rationale

Delta College faculty and staff who attended the meeting on Criteria 3 and 4, described the College focus on its top 30 courses (by enrollment) and top 10 programs (by enrollment), accounting for 80% of student demand. Additionally, Key Performance Indicators (KPI's) are grounded in enrollment, student success (this is course-level success: A, B, C), fall to fall retention, and completion of an award. A dashboard has been created by Institutional Research (IR) to visualize the process made each year by the college. In viewing the dashboard, the College may wish to re-evaluate their goals on an annual basis to see if they continue to be relevant. While it is common for colleges to set lofty goals and not attain them, Delta has perhaps been too cautious in these four KPIs.

During the Criterion 3 and 4 meeting, those present described how Program Advisory Committees (PACs) participate in curriculum and KSA (knowledge, skills, and abilities) reviews, which was raised in the 2020 review by the Team. The College has a large number of PACs with high numbers of participants, many of them alumni of the program, which provides evidence of a significant level of commitment to the ongoing success of the program.

The team learned that college departments are no longer producing their own data, but instead are provided data by Institutional Research (IR). Members of the team met with IR to view the dashboards and databases described in the argument to see what level of disaggregation is provided by the dashboards and confirm what was described in the argument. The College has made a commitment to being data-informed as well as data-literate, which is commendable. The President has provided IR with Tableau, a data visualization tool that will be a great help in creating both static and dynamic reporting as the users become increasingly proficient in its use and the College becomes

accustomed to seeking out data to inform their processes.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

4.S - Criterion 4 - Summary

The institution demonstrates responsibility for the quality of its educational programs, learning environments and support services, and it evaluates their effectiveness for student learning through processes designed to promote continuous improvement.

Rationale

Delta College has made significant progress since their 2020 review, when the Team determined that 4.A. and 4.B. were met with concern. This led to an interim report that was submitted by the College in September 2023.

The new President has brought renewed energy and commitment to student success and completion through a new Strategic Plan. Delta's Strategic Plan is truly a living document, embraced across the college, as evidenced again and again in multiple meetings with faculty, staff, and administration. Commitment to the mission was also evident and attested to in meetings, even the meeting with students.

The challenge to Delta in this next cycle will be to institutionalize their new processes for program review and assessment. The plans, as described in the argument, may be difficult to maintain now that the review is completed. Soliciting regular faculty feedback about process implementation might be needed to ensure continuous quality improvement. Faculty with whom the visiting team spoke to in onsite meetings did not provide consistent understanding around assessment.

5 - Institutional Effectiveness, Resources and Planning

The institution's resources, structures, processes and planning are sufficient to fulfill its mission, improve the quality of its educational offerings, and respond to future challenges and opportunities.

5.A - Core Component 5.A

Through its administrative structures and collaborative processes, the institution's leadership demonstrates that it is effective and enables the institution to fulfill its mission.

1. Shared governance at the institution engages its internal constituencies—including its governing board, administration, faculty, staff and students—through planning, policies and procedures.
2. The institution's administration uses data to reach informed decisions in the best interests of the institution and its constituents.
3. The institution's administration ensures that faculty and, when appropriate, staff and students are involved in setting academic requirements, policy and processes through effective collaborative structures.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Since the last HLC visit in 2020 Delta College has undergone significant institutional change (new president, new strategic plan) that has contributed to a strengthened commitment to shared governance. The faculty are now unionized and new practices for faculty are outlined in the collective bargaining agreement. Faculty representatives from their bargaining unit meet regularly with the director of human resources and frequently interact with the president and key college leadership. Consistent with the new strategic plan, through subcommittees of the Council on Innovation, Diversity and Equity (CIBE), Delta's new governance model focuses on prioritizing student success, diversifying employee culture, and eliminating opportunity gaps for students and employees.

It is evident that Delta's institutional strategic plan provides the foundation that guides all college functions and activities. The plan is grounded in the College's mission and vision. Delta's values, of service, teamwork, respect, innovation, veracity, and excellence (STRIVE) provide the framework for four pillars of the strategic plan (student engagement, people focus, community-centered, and social impact) which, in turn, establish the foundation for initiatives and action plans. The strength and utility of the plan reflects the broad participation of both internal and external constituencies in its development and implementation. Key performance indicators (enrollment, student success, retention, completion) provide metrics by which Delta can mark progress in their efforts to provide a comprehensive menu of educational services to a broad array of students.

Conversations in meetings with campus administrative leadership affirmed Delta's commitment to be data-driven, using data available in many forms to make decisions that affect academic programs, resource allocation/management, human resources, and community engagement. Enrollment and completion challenges are being addressed through a campus-wide expanded use of data. Staff from Institutional Research met with visiting team members to demonstrate the various ways in which Delta College faculty, administrators, and staff utilize data in their day to day activities.

Delta College is working to resolve enrollment and completion challenges by implementing innovative solutions, which has required a campus-wide expanded use of data. These data related to enrollment, retention and completion, are examined further through an equity lens, consistent with collegiate commitment to close equity gaps.

Through the CIBE, Curriculum Council, and Budget Cabinet, Delta's administration ensures that faculty and, when appropriate, staff and students are involved in setting academic requirements and establishing policy and processes through effective collaborative structures that guide resource allocation and management.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

5.B - Core Component 5.B

The institution's resource base supports its educational offerings and its plans for maintaining and strengthening their quality in the future.

1. The institution has qualified and trained operational staff and infrastructure sufficient to support its operations wherever and however programs are delivered.
2. The goals incorporated into the mission and any related statements are realistic in light of the institution's organization, resources and opportunities.
3. The institution has a well-developed process in place for budgeting and for monitoring its finances.
4. The institution's fiscal allocations ensure that its educational purposes are achieved.

Rating

Met

Rationale

The manner in which Delta College allocates its resources (faculty, staff) aligns with its strategic plan. It is evident from the wage history by employee group and its annual allocation to the general fund operating budget that Delta is committed to a qualified and fairly compensated human resource pool of faculty and staff.

Further evidence of this commitment to quality is reflected in collegiate resources dedicated to on-going professional development. Faculty receive an annual allowance of \$1100 to support their professional development. Professional staff receive a annual allowance of \$500 and support staff members receive \$275 annually. On-going staff development opportunities are available through the college's Center for Organizational Success and the Faculty Center for Teaching Excellence.

The goals of Delta College have been powerfully articulated through its strategic plan for 2023-27 which is mission driven and reflects careful, continuous scrutiny of available resources to support on-going and new strategic initiatives and institutional action plans.

Onsite conversations with the team reinforced observations in the assurance argument of Delta College's strong fiscal basis of operation, with no outstanding bonding and no debt. Delta's general fund budget is \$74.9 million and, as a public institution, Delta College does not have a relationship with any subordinate entity. Delta College Trustees have chosen to seek millage renewals every eight years. Revenue from the millage provides important financial support for current and emerging instructional programs, workforce training, equipment updates, and facilities maintenance.

In addition to public dollars from the millage, Delta College has actively pursued and attained private-sector financial support for many of its programs and activities. Since it was established in 1978, the Delta College Foundation has raised over \$107 million in private-sector dollars to support students. The Foundation maintains partnerships with other foundations, corporations, and individuals in the community which allow it to secure private sector contributions for projects both

large and small, with over a \$33.7 million endowment.

Delta's process for budgeting and monitoring ensures that fiscal resources are allocated to support its educational purposes. The college strives to provide learning environments that enable its employees to deliver and support an educational experience for students that is relevant, state-of-the art, and diverse. The budget process includes active involvement of a Budget Cabinet comprised of cross section of Delta employees, including faculty and staff. These cabinet members are identified and recommended annually by the Vice President for Business and Finance for appointment by the President. The primary role of the Budget Cabinet is to scan the fiscal environment of Delta College including attention to enrollment patterns, inflation, and tuition rates at other post-secondary institutions to present a recommendation for any changes/increases in tuition and fees for the coming year. The visiting team was impressed with the impact of this eclectic body and the role it serves, providing an opportunity to broaden awareness of key budget and resource issue among a diverse group of Delta staff.

Delta's annual transfer of \$2.5 million from its general fund resources to physical plant funds provides evidence of exemplary fiscal stewardship that ensures continuing attention to evolving infrastructure needs.. Further, a portion of any annual excess savings over its 10% fund balance from its general fund is allocated to the plant fund, a practice which allows for savings beyond the annual \$2.5 million to accumulate for future infrastructure needs beyond deferred maintenance projects.

Delta's annual independent financial audits are published online. Over the last 10 audits, the College has received a clean audit opinion with no management comments and no management letter issued.

Delta's fiscal allocations ensure that its educational purposes are achieved. Facing declining enrollment, Delta's solid foundation of financial stability and resource management has allowed it to continue to offer a quality education. In addition to a strong elected Board of Trustees, an effective budgeting process and a dynamic strategic plan aligned with collegiate mission and vision has enabled Delta College to sustain an excellent, high quality program of education and service.

Assigned Reviewers

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

5.C - Core Component 5.C

The institution engages in systematic and integrated planning and improvement.

1. The institution allocates its resources in alignment with its mission and priorities, including, as applicable, its comprehensive research enterprise, associated institutes and affiliated centers.
2. The institution links its processes for assessment of student learning, evaluation of operations, planning and budgeting.
3. The planning process encompasses the institution as a whole and considers the perspectives of internal and external constituent groups.
4. The institution plans on the basis of a sound understanding of its current capacity, including fluctuations in the institution's sources of revenue and enrollment.
5. Institutional planning anticipates evolving external factors, such as technology advancements, demographic shifts, globalization, the economy and state support.
6. The institution implements its plans to systematically improve its operations and student outcomes.

Rating

Met

Rationale

Delta's budget planning process aligns directly with the strategic plan. The process begins with a review of the strategic initiatives and development of a tentative set of planning and budget assumptions including enrollment projections, state funding, and anticipated auxiliary revenues. The Budget Cabinet, appointed by the President provides oversight of this review to enable the development of recommendations for tuition and fee adjustments (increases or not).

It is evident that Delta College links its processes for assessment of student learning, evaluation of operations, and planning and budgeting. If assessment of student learning data indicate areas where students need more assistance, Delta is prepared to respond to this identified need with additional equipment, supplies, or staff, such as tutors. Documentation of these needs along with the supporting, data-driven evidence would be submitted for consideration for the upcoming budget cycle. Although the link between assessment and budgeting was clear, the Team believes that Delta could improve on articulating this connection to the campus community.

During the Criterion Five meeting the team heard clarification regarding how Delta College distinguishes between student success and retention. Delta students successfully complete 80% of the courses in which they enroll while 20% of Delta students successfully complete an Associate's degree.

Support to address student retention by removing barriers, strengthening the sense of belonging, and expanding workforce strategies is reflected by a reallocation of over \$800,000 in the current fiscal year. As this reallocation offers powerful evidence for support of one of the KPI's in the strategic plan, it serves as a useful message for the President to communicate with the campus community.

Other examples of alignment among assessment, planning, and resource allocation include Admissions and Dual Enrollment/Early Middle College Supplies and Software, Reserve for Future Strategic Initiatives, MI Reconnect limitations, Enrollment and other Operational Contingencies, and Collegiate Recovery Program in Student Counseling and Support Services.

The four strategic pillars (student engagement, retention and completion; people focus; community-centered; social impact) of Delta College establish the foundation for the initiatives and action projects that are part of Delta's Strategic Plan. The plan reflects the active engagement of both internal and external stakeholder groups in its development and implementation. Its four phase planning process (visioning, development, deployment, review) is grounded in the four pillars, affording the opportunity to measure progress on specific action projects at mid year and year-end. These project reviews are loaded into the college's strategic planning and budgeting database for adjustments as specific project goals are achieved. Progress on institutional action projects is measured at mid-year and year-end. The President's Cabinet receives regular updates on the action projects and keeps the Board of Trustees apprised of plan progress through presentations at both regular and dinner meetings.

Through a conservative budgeting model including setting aside reserves and 10% fund balance, Delta College administration and Board of Trustees provide evidence of fiscal stewardship and savvy resource management, helping to ensure that the College is positioned to handle fluctuations in enrollment while meeting the needs of the students and the goals of their strategic plan.

The Budget Cabinet regularly uses a benchmarking tool to compare the impact of tuition and fees on a student's educational costs for a year across all 28 Michigan community colleges. In 2022-2023 the State average for tuition and fees for 30 contact hours per year was \$4,662. At a total annual cost of \$4,460, Delta falls below the state average by \$202, or approximately 4.3%. Delta College's in-district annual tuition and fees cost compared to four-year institutions within a 75-mile radius is the lowest. The visiting team felt this is important because these are the institutions to which Delta students are most likely to transfer after attending Delta or may choose to attend instead of Delta.

Interim Monitoring (if applicable)

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

5.S - Criterion 5 - Summary

The institution's resources, structures, processes and planning are sufficient to fulfill its mission, improve the quality of its educational offerings, and respond to future challenges and opportunities.

Rationale

Grounded in its mission, vision, and values, Delta College effectively utilizes its dynamic strategic plan as a road map, providing a pathway to guide educational activity and resource management across all dimensions of institutional endeavor. Its strong financial reserve and absence of debt provide strong evidence of Delta's commitment to provide a high quality educational experience for all of the publics it serves and respond to future challenges and opportunities.

Review Dashboard

Number	Title	Rating
1	Mission	
1.A	Core Component 1.A	Met
1.B	Core Component 1.B	Met
1.C	Core Component 1.C	Met
1.S	Criterion 1 - Summary	
2	Integrity: Ethical and Responsible Conduct	
2.A	Core Component 2.A	Met
2.B	Core Component 2.B	Met
2.C	Core Component 2.C	Met
2.D	Core Component 2.D	Met
2.E	Core Component 2.E	Met
2.S	Criterion 2 - Summary	
3	Teaching and Learning: Quality, Resources and Support	
3.A	Core Component 3.A	Met
3.B	Core Component 3.B	Met
3.C	Core Component 3.C	Met
3.D	Core Component 3.D	Met
3.S	Criterion 3 - Summary	
4	Teaching and Learning: Evaluation and Improvement	
4.A	Core Component 4.A	Met
4.B	Core Component 4.B	Met
4.C	Core Component 4.C	Met
4.S	Criterion 4 - Summary	
5	Institutional Effectiveness, Resources and Planning	
5.A	Core Component 5.A	Met
5.B	Core Component 5.B	Met
5.C	Core Component 5.C	Met
5.S	Criterion 5 - Summary	

Review Summary

Conclusion

The visiting team conducted a comprehensive mid-cycle review of Delta College on April 22-23, 2024. During the most recent, previous comprehensive review in 2020 that team found core components 4a and 4b to be met with concern and directed Delta College to file monitoring reports addressing those concerns. Delta's monitoring reports were received and accepted by the HLC in 2023. While the current team determined that all core components were met, the team provided Delta College with suggestions and recommendations throughout its review of criteria 2, 3, and 4 for institutional consideration. Specifically, in Core Component 2B, the team noted that the most recent data points regarding retention and program pass rates were from the fall of 2019-2020 and recommended that these data should be updated to ensure that the most current rates are available to students and other audiences.

In Core Component 3A the team recommended that Delta should articulate program level outcomes more consistently on the college website for all associate degree and stand-alone certificate programs. In Core Component 4B the team noted that Delta College, through its Student Learning Action Committee (SLAC), should develop a communication strategy around the many-faceted processes related to assessment of student learning. The team observed in the Criterion Four summary that soliciting regular faculty feedback about process implementation for both program review and assessment might be needed to ensure continuous quality improvement.

Delta College has made significant progress since its 2020 review. The new President has brought renewed energy and commitment to student success and completion via a new Strategic Plan. The plan is powerfully aligned with Delta's mission, vision, and values and has been embraced across the college, as evidenced again and again in multiple meetings with faculty, staff, and administration. Delta's dynamic strategic plan serves as a road map, providing a pathway to guide educational activity and resource management across all dimensions of institutional endeavor. Delta's strong financial reserve and absence of debt provide strong evidence of the College's commitment to offer a high quality educational experience for all of the publics it serves and respond to future challenges and opportunities.

Overall Recommendations

Criteria For Accreditation

Met

Sanctions Recommendation

No Sanction

Pathways Recommendation

Not Applicable to This Review

No Interim Monitoring Recommended.

INTERNAL



Institutional Status and Requirements (ISR) Worksheet

Review Details

Institution: Delta College, Michigan

Type of Review: Standard Pathway - Mid-Cycle Review

Description:

Review Dates: 04/22/2024 - 04/23/2024

No Change in Institutional Status and Requirements

Accreditation Status

Status: Accredited

No Change

Recommended Change:

Degrees Awarded: Associates

No Change

Recommended Change:

Reaffirmation of Accreditation:

Year of Last Reaffirmation of Accreditation: 2020 - 2021

Year of Next Reaffirmation of Accreditation: 2029 - 2030

No Change

Recommended Change:

Accreditation Stipulations

General:

The institution is approved at the following program level(s): Associate's

The institution is not approved at the following program level(s): Bachelor's, Master's, Specialist, Doctoral

- No Change
- Recommended Change:

Additional Locations:

Prior HLC approval required.

- No Change
- Recommended Change:

Distance and Correspondence Courses and Programs:

Approved for distance education courses and programs. Approved for correspondence education courses and programs.

- No Change
- Recommended Change:

Competency-Based Education:

- No Change
- Recommended Change:

Pell-Eligible Prison Education Program:

- No Change
- Recommended Change:

Accreditation Events

Pathway for Reaffirmation of Accreditation: Standard Pathway

- No Change
- Recommended Change:

Upcoming Reviews:

Comprehensive Evaluation Visit - 2029 - 2030

Federal Compliance Review - 2029 - 2030

No Change

Recommended Change:

Upcoming Branch Campus or Additional Location Reviews:

No Upcoming Reviews

No Change

Recommended Change:

Monitoring

Upcoming Monitoring Reviews:

No Upcoming Reviews

No Change

Recommended Change:

Institutional Data

Academic Programs Offered:

Undergraduate Programs		
Associate Degrees:	73	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No Change <input type="checkbox"/> Recommended Change:
Baccalaureate Degrees:	0	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No Change <input type="checkbox"/> Recommended Change:
Graduate Programs		
Master's Degrees:	0	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No Change <input type="checkbox"/> Recommended Change:
Specialist Degrees:	0	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No Change <input type="checkbox"/> Recommended Change:

Doctoral Degrees:	0	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No Change <input type="checkbox"/> Recommended Change:
Certificate Programs		
Certificates:	81	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No Change <input type="checkbox"/> Recommended Change:

Contractual Arrangements:

No Contractual Arrangements

- No Change
- Recommended Change:

Off-Campus Activities

Branch Campuses:

No Branch Campuses

- No Change
- Recommended Change:

Additional Locations:

Delta College Planetarium and Learning Center, 100 Center Avenue, Bay City, Michigan 48708 United States

Bay-Arenac Intermediate School District (BAISD) Career Center, 4155 Monitor Rd., Bay City, Michigan 48706 United States

Saginaw Correctional Facility, 9625 Pierce Road, Freeland, Michigan 48623 United States

Downtown Midland Center, 419 E. Ellsworth, Midland, Michigan 48640 United States

Downtown Saginaw Learning Center, 319 E. Genesee Avenue, Saginaw, Michigan 48607 United States

- No Change
- Recommended Change: